

# Table of Contents

<i>Editorial Panel</i> .....	iii
<i>Dedication</i> .....	v
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	xvii
<i>Introduction</i> .....	xxxiii

## PART I      LAW APPLICABLE TO TESTAMENTARY DISPOSITIONS

<i>Chapter 1</i>	<b>Testamentary Capacity Necessary for a Will</b> .....	3
	1 Summary of Testamentary Capacity .....	4
	2 Onus and Standard of Proof .....	7
	(a) Onus of Proof for Testamentary Capacity .....	7
	(b) Standard of Proof for Testamentary Capacity .....	8
	(c) Meaning of Scrutinizing “According to Gravity” .....	8
	3 The Presumption of Testamentary Capacity .....	12
	(a) The Presumption of Testamentary Capacity in General ....	12
	(b) The Expression of the Presumption in <i>Vout v. Hay</i> .....	14
	(c) Triggering the Presumption of Testamentary Capacity .....	22
	(d) Displacing the Presumption of Capacity .....	32
	(e) Nature of the Presumption of Capacity .....	35
	(f) Sidestepping the Presumption of Capacity .....	36
	(g) Relying on the Presumption of Capacity .....	39
	(h) Application to Other Testamentary Documents .....	41
	4 The Test from <i>Banks v. Goodfellow</i> .....	43
	5 Efforts at a Modern Restatement of the Test .....	46
	6 Meaning of a “Disposing Mind and Memory” .....	47
	7 Test Broken Down by Elements .....	49
	(a) Assets .....	49
	(b) Objects of Bounty .....	58
	(c) Nature and Effect of Will .....	64
	(d) Common Field of View .....	70
	8 Technical Provisions and Tax Structuring .....	72
	9 The Diminishing Mind .....	77
	(a) A Failing Mind Can Still Exhibit Testamentary Capacity .....	77
	(b) The “Imprecise Divide” .....	80
	(c) Underlying Judicial Policy .....	80
	10 Disorders of the Mind .....	82
	11 Practical Nature of the Test .....	88
	12 Standard for Capacity at Execution of a Will .....	90

viii TABLE OF CONTENTS

	(a) Timing of Testamentary Capacity in General .....	90
	(b) Historical Review of <i>Parker v. Felgate</i> and the English Case Law .....	91
	(c) The Application of <i>Parker v. Felgate</i> in Canada .....	101
	(d) Expanding the Principles From <i>Parker v. Felgate</i> .....	103
	(e) Actual Understanding versus Capacity to Understand .....	105
	(f) Impact of Delay .....	106
	(g) Change of Mind .....	107
13	Relevant and Irrelevant Considerations .....	110
	(a) Ability to Carry On Normal Conversation .....	110
	(b) Eccentricity .....	111
	(c) The Content of the Will Itself .....	112
	(d) Miscellaneous Considerations .....	115
14	Medical Assessments .....	117
15	Relaxing the Test from <i>Banks v. Goodfellow</i> .....	123
16	Impact on Will Instrument and Availability of Severance .....	127
	(a) Impact of Incapacity in General .....	127
	(b) Void or Voidable .....	127
	(c) Availability or Non-Availability of Severance .....	131
<i>Chapter 2</i>	<b>The Impact of Delusions on Will-Making</b> .....	145
1	Delusions in Summary .....	145
2	Definition of Delusion .....	147
3	Requirement that Delusion be Impelling .....	152
4	Lucid Intervals .....	156
5	Delusions as to Fact Contrasted to Delusions as to Motive .....	158
6	Delusions Contrasted With Mistaken Beliefs .....	164
7	Delusions Contrasted With Disorders of the Mind .....	166
8	Delusions Causing Rational Wills .....	169
9	Lay and Medical Evidence of Delusions .....	172
10	Influencing Non-Dispositive Provisions .....	173
<i>Chapter 3</i>	<b>Testamentary Dispositions Other Than Wills</b> .....	175
1	Codicils .....	175
	(a) General Rules for Codicils .....	175
	(b) Applicable Capacity Test for Codicils .....	176
	(c) The Impact of Republication .....	181
2	The Capacity to Revoke a Will .....	184
	(a) Revocation in General .....	184
	(b) Onus and Standard of Proof for Revocation .....	185
	(c) Applicable Capacity Test for Revocation .....	187
	(d) Presumption of Revocation in Lost Will Situations .....	192
3	Beneficiary Designations .....	193
	(a) Beneficiary Designations Generally .....	193

	(b) Applicable Capacity Test for Beneficiary Designations ....	195
	(c) The Interface with Contract .....	204
	(d) Concurrent with Other Dispositions .....	205
<i>Chapter 4</i>	<b>Knowledge and Approval</b> .....	207
	1 Summary of Knowledge and Approval .....	207
	2 Onus and Standard of Proof for Knowledge and Approval .....	209
	(a) Onus of Proof for Knowledge and Approval .....	209
	(b) Standard of Proof for Knowledge and Approval .....	210
	3 Presumption of Knowledge and Approval .....	216
	(a) The Presumption of Knowledge and Approval in General .....	216
	(b) Triggering the Presumption of Knowledge and Approval .....	218
	(c) Displacing the Presumption of Knowledge and Approval .....	227
	(d) Relationship Between the Two Presumptions .....	231
	4 Knowledge and Approval as a Separate Requirement .....	234
	5 The Core Concept of Knowledge and Approval .....	236
	6 Mistake .....	237
	7 Barriers of Language and Literacy .....	238
	8 No Requirement that Will be Read .....	239
	9 Knowledge and Approval as a Precursor Issue .....	241
	10 Boiler-Plate and Other Add-in Clauses .....	244
	11 Predators – The Doctrine of Righteousness .....	247
	(a) Doctrine of Righteousness in General .....	247
	(b) History and Development of the Requirement for True and Informed Approval .....	249
	(c) Applicability to Beneficiary Designations and Other Transfers .....	270
	(d) Doctrine Operating as an Effective Bar to Probate .....	274
	(e) Proper Characterization of the Rule .....	276
	12 Impact of Lack of Knowledge and Approval on Will Instrument .....	279
	(a) Void or Voidable Where Knowledge and Approval Absent .....	279
	(b) Severance Where Knowledge and Approval Absent .....	280
	(c) Severance Compared to Equitable Rectification .....	286
	(d) Possibility of Ratification by Will-Maker .....	293
<i>Chapter 5</i>	<b>Undue Influence as a Challenge to Wills</b> .....	301
	1 Testamentary Undue Influence Generally .....	301
	2 Onus and Standard of Proof for Testamentary Undue Influence .....	304

x TABLE OF CONTENTS

	(a) Onus of Proof for Testamentary Undue Influence .....	304
	(b) Standard of Proof for Testamentary Undue Influence .....	306
3	Type of Conduct Amounting to Testamentary Undue Influence .....	306
	(a) Conduct Must Amount to Coercion .....	306
	(b) Persuasion Permitted for Wills .....	316
	(c) Fraud as a Subspecies of Undue Influence .....	318
4	Causation as a Necessary Requirement .....	324
5	No Presumption of Undue Influence .....	325
	(a) Presumption of Undue Influence Not Applying to Wills .....	325
	(b) Presumption Not Applying to Other Testamentary Dispositions .....	345
6	Impact on Will Instrument and Availability of Severance .....	347
	(a) Void or Voidable for Testamentary Undue Influence .....	347
	(b) Availability of Severance in Undue Influence Cases .....	349
PART II	LAW APPLICABLE TO <i>INTER VIVOS</i> DISPOSITIONS	
<i>Chapter 6</i>	<b>Capacity to Make <i>Inter Vivos</i> Wealth Transfers</b> .....	355
1	Capacity for <i>Inter Vivos</i> Transfers Summarized .....	355
2	Onus and Standard of Proof .....	358
	(a) Summary Relating to Onus and Standard in Gift Cases ....	358
	(b) Case Law Review Relating to Onus of Proof in Gift Cases .....	359
	(c) Conclusions Relating to Onus .....	368
	(d) Standard of Proof in <i>Inter Vivos</i> Wealth Transfers .....	371
3	Test for Capacity Applicable to Gifts .....	373
	(a) Traditional Expression of the Test .....	373
	(b) The Modern Evolution of the Test Applying to Gifts .....	374
	(c) The Application of the Test to Various Kinds of Gifts ....	378
4	Test Applicable to Other <i>Inter Vivos</i> Wealth Transfers .....	385
	(a) Transfers into Joint Tenancy .....	385
	(b) Settlements of Property into Trust .....	391
	(c) Other <i>Inter Vivos</i> Wealth Transfers .....	395
5	Standard for Capacity at Execution for <i>Inter Vivos</i> Transfer ....	395
6	Impact of Finding of Incapacity on Gift .....	398
7	Special Rule for Wards of Court .....	407
<i>Chapter 7</i>	<b>Intention to Make <i>Inter Vivos</i> Wealth Transfers</b> .....	415
1	Intention for <i>Inter Vivos</i> Transfers Summarized .....	415
2	Onus and Standard of Proof Relating to Intent .....	417
	(a) General Approach to Onus and Standard .....	417
	(b) The English Approach to Onus and Presumptions .....	418

	(c) The Canadian Approach to Onus and Presumptions .....	425
	(d) The Conceptual Model for Explaining Onus .....	429
	(e) Applicability of the Presumption of Advancement .....	434
3	The Requirement for Intent .....	436
	(a) The Core Requirement .....	436
	(b) Intent Required for an <i>Inter Vivos</i> Gift .....	438
	(c) Intent Required for a Gift <i>Donatio Mortis Causa</i> .....	440
	(d) Intent Required to Settle a Trust .....	441
4	Marshalling Evidence to Establish Intent .....	443
	(a) The Parol Evidence Rule .....	443
	(b) Evidence Before and After the Act .....	451
5	Comparing Intention to Knowledge and Approval .....	452
6	<i>Non Est Factum</i> .....	455
7	The Impact of Want of Intention .....	465
8	Rectification .....	468
<i>Chapter 8</i>	<b><i>Inter Vivos Undue Influence</i></b> .....	471
1	Summary of <i>Inter Vivos</i> Undue Influence .....	471
2	Onus and Standard of Proof for <i>Inter Vivos</i> Undue Influence .....	476
	(a) Onus of Proof for <i>Inter Vivos</i> Undue Influence .....	476
	(b) Standard of Proof for <i>Inter Vivos</i> Undue Influence .....	477
	(c) Operation of the Presumption of Undue Influence .....	478
3	Categorizing <i>Inter Vivos</i> Undue Influence .....	485
4	Undue Influence by Conduct (“Actual Undue Influence”) .....	488
	(a) Undue Influence by Conduct Generally .....	488
	(b) Types of Conduct Amounting to Actual Undue Influence .....	491
	(c) Distinguishing Between Persuasion and Actual Undue Influence .....	497
5	Undue Influence by Relationship (“Presumed Undue Influence”) .....	498
	(a) Undue Influence by Relationship Generally .....	498
	(b) Relationships That Qualify .....	499
	(c) Transactions That Qualify .....	509
	(d) The Relationship as Imposing Duties .....	512
	(e) Impact of Relationship on Conduct Threshold .....	517
	(f) Defending the Wealth Transfer from Undue Influence by Relationship .....	523
6	Some <i>Inter Vivos</i> Transfers Treated as Testamentary .....	529
7	Gifts Rendered Voidable and Not Void .....	533
8	Equitable Defences of Laches and Acquiescence .....	534
9	Securing the Return of Assets from Innocent Third Parties .....	537
<i>Chapter 9</i>	<b>Other Equitable Challenges to Gifts</b> .....	541

xii TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	Equitable Challenges in General .....	541
2	Unconscionable Bargains (Exploitation of Special Disadvantage) .....	545
	(a) Unconscionable Bargains in General .....	545
	(b) English Case Law .....	548
	(c) Evolution of the Doctrine in Canada .....	549
	(d) The Applicable Onus and Presumption for Unconscionable Bargain .....	557
	(e) The Best Expression of the Doctrine of Unconscionable Bargain .....	559
	(f) The Requirement for Special Disadvantage .....	562
	(g) The Requirement for Undervalue .....	563
	(h) Relational Inequality Versus Special Disadvantage .....	567
	(i) Whether Culpable Conduct Required .....	567
	(j) Impact and Remedy for Unconscionable Bargain .....	569
3	Unconscionable Procurement .....	569
	(a) Unconscionable Procurement Generally .....	569
	(b) The Applicable Onus and Presumption for Unconscionable Procurement .....	572
	(c) The Best Expression of the Doctrine of Unconscionable Procurement .....	575
	(d) Situations Where Applicable .....	581
	(e) Defending the Wealth Transfer from Unconscionable Procurement .....	587
	(f) Whether a Freestanding Doctrine .....	595
	(g) Current Status of the Doctrine .....	597
	(h) The Requirement That the Gift Be Significant .....	601
	(i) Whether Conduct Must Be Culpable .....	603
	(j) Comparison to Common Law Doctrine of Righteousness .....	605
	(k) Impact and Remedy .....	606
4	Transactions Amounting to Equitable Fraud .....	608
5	Transactions Violating the Policy of the Law .....	610

PART III GENERAL ISSUES

<i>Chapter 10</i>	<b>Overarching Capacity Principles</b> .....	617
	1 An Across-the-Board Test for Capacity .....	617
	2 An Across-the-Board Approach to Onus .....	621
	3 Theoretical Considerations Relating to Capacity .....	624
	(a) Intrinsic Complexity as a Consideration .....	624
	(b) Significance as a Consideration .....	624
	(c) Social Purpose as a Consideration .....	625
	(d) Linear Increase Model .....	626
	(e) Dual Roles Model .....	627
	(f) Different Tests for Different Purposes .....	628

	4	The Concept of a Capacity Hierarchy .....	629
<i>Chapter 11</i>		<b>Compound Transactions</b> .....	633
	1	The Challenge Presented by Compound Transactions .....	633
	2	Dealing with Capacity in Compound Transactions .....	634
		(a) Framework for Addressing Capacity in Compound Transactions .....	634
		(b) Capacity and Same-Day Compound Transactions .....	636
		(c) Capacity and Multiple-Day Compound Transactions .....	638
	3	Intention and Testamentary Knowledge and Approval .....	640
		(a) Framework for Addressing Intention and Testamentary Knowledge and Approval .....	640
		(b) Intention and Testamentary Knowledge and Approval in Same-Day Compound Transactions .....	641
		(c) Intention and Testamentary Knowledge and Approval in Multiple-Day Compound Transactions .....	641
	4	Testamentary Undue Influence and <i>Inter Vivos</i> Undue Influence .....	642
		(a) Framework for Addressing Testamentary and <i>Inter Vivos</i> Undue Influence .....	642
		(b) Undue Influence in Same-Day Compound Transactions ...	642
		(c) Undue Influence in Multiple-Day Compound Transactions .....	643
	5	Dealing with Procurement in Compound Transactions .....	646
		(a) Framework for Addressing Procurement in Compound Transactions .....	646
		(b) Procurement in the Context of Same-Day Compound Transactions .....	647
		(c) Procurement in the Context of Multiple-Day Compound Transactions .....	647
	6	Framework for Addressing Other Types of Challenge .....	647
<i>Chapter 12</i>		<b>Controlling for Capacity During Planning</b> .....	651
	1	General Remarks .....	651
	2	Interviewing and Taking Instructions .....	655
		(a) The Process of Asking Questions .....	655
		(b) The “Bounty Question” .....	658
		(c) Additional Screening Questions .....	660
		(d) Dealing Directly with Will-Maker .....	660
	3	Making Notes .....	662
	4	Verifying Information .....	663
	5	Commissioning Medical Assessments .....	664
		(a) General Comments and Suggestions .....	664
		(b) Sample Letters of Commission .....	669
	6	Active Assessment Techniques .....	696

xiv TABLE OF CONTENTS

	(a) Recovered Capacity .....	697
	(b) Charts and Graphs .....	699
	(c) Gearing the Plan to the Capacity Level .....	701
	(d) Manipulating the Interview Circumstances .....	701
7	Steps at Execution .....	702
8	Grey Area Execution When Capacity in Doubt .....	703
	(a) The Case for Proceeding to Execution .....	704
	(b) The Permissible Level of Doubt .....	711
9	Suggested Practice Protocols .....	713
	(a) Assessing Capacity in the Normal Course .....	713
	(b) Assessing Questionable Capacity in an Emergency Setting .....	716
	(c) Assessing Questionable Capacity in a Non-Emergency ....	719
10	Tear-Away Wills .....	721
11	Codicils Republishing and Confirming .....	724
12	Retainer to “Bullet Proof” a Will .....	724
13	Structuring the Retainer .....	726
<i>Chapter 13</i>	<b>Controlling for Other Types of Challenge .....</b>	<b>731</b>
1	Controlling for Testamentary Undue Influence .....	732
	(a) General Comments in Controlling for Testamentary Undue Influence .....	732
	(b) Express the Concern to the Client .....	732
	(c) Interview Alone .....	733
	(d) Ask Blunt Questions .....	733
	(e) Offer a Confidential Replacement Will .....	734
	(f) Course of Conduct in “Grey Area” .....	736
	(g) Fee Considerations in Dealing with Undue Influence .....	737
	(h) Medical Opinions and Testamentary Undue Influence .....	738
	(i) Protocol Controlling for Testamentary Undue Influence .....	739
2	Controlling for Testamentary Knowledge and Approval .....	740
	(a) General Comments in Controlling for Testamentary Knowledge and Approval .....	740
	(b) Confirming Knowledge and Approval in the Ordinary Course .....	740
	(c) Identifying Procurers .....	742
	(d) Confirming Knowledge and Approval When Procurer Present .....	742
	(e) A Protocol to Respond to the Doctrine of Righteousness .....	744
	(f) The Interface with Diminished Capacity .....	745
	(g) Grey Area Executions When Knowledge and Approval is at Question .....	745
3	Controlling for <i>Inter Vivos</i> Intention .....	746



4	Controlling for <i>Inter Vivos</i> Undue Influence and Other Challenges .....	747
	(a) General Comments in Controlling for Equitable Challenges .....	747
	(b) Look for Victimization .....	748
	(c) Look for Protective Measures .....	749
	(d) Ensure Advice Independent .....	749
	(e) Ensure True and Complete Understanding .....	751
	(f) Have Client Sign-Off on Warning .....	752
	(g) Possible Value of Medical Opinion .....	753
	(h) The Problem Posed by Grey Area Execution .....	755
	(i) A Protocol to Deal With Equitable Challenges .....	756
	(j) Elder Abuse and Breaching Confidentiality .....	757
<i>Chapter 14</i>	<b>Liability for Negligence During the Planning Process</b> .....	759
1	General Remarks in Relation to Liability .....	759
2	Liability to Intended Beneficiaries .....	759
3	Liability to Beneficiaries Under Prior Wills .....	761
4	Case Law Review .....	763
<i>Index</i>	.....	771